Contents

Preface
Acknowledgements xv

1 Motivations 1
  1.1 What this book is, and is not, about .......................... 1
  1.2 Motivating Rhetorical Relations ................................. 6
    1.2.1 Temporal Structure ....................................... 6
    1.2.2 Anaphora and VP Ellipsis .................................. 8
    1.2.3 Bridging .................................................. 18
    1.2.4 Presuppositions .......................................... 23
    1.2.5 Lexical Ambiguity ........................................ 26
    1.2.6 Implicature in Dialogue .................................. 28
  1.3 Rhetorical Relations in Corpora ............................... 32
  1.4 Conclusions .................................................. 35

2 Semantic Models of Discourse Interpretation 39
  2.1 Introduction ................................................. 39
  2.2 Dynamic Semantics ........................................... 39
  2.3 DRSs: Syntax and Semantics ................................. 45
    2.3.1 A Basic Fragment ....................................... 46
    2.3.2 The Semantics of DRSs .................................. 47
    2.3.3 Questions ............................................ 49
    2.3.4 Requests ............................................. 51
  2.4 Construction and Underspecification ........................ 54
  2.5 Why Dynamic Semantics is Not Enough ....................... 60
    2.5.1 Anaphora ................................................ 60
    2.5.2 Temporal Anaphora ...................................... 62
    2.5.3 Presuppositions ........................................ 63
  2.6 Conclusion .................................................. 67
### 3 Pragmatic Models of Discourse Interpretation

3.1 Introduction ......................................................... 69
3.2 Traditional Theories of Pragmatics ................................. 71
  3.2.1 Relevance Theory ............................................. 75
  3.2.2 Against The Belief Change Model of Discourse Content .... 76
  3.2.3 Two Logics: The Logic of Information Content and the Logic of Information Packaging ......................... 78
3.3 Cognitive Approaches to Discourse Interpretation .......... 81
  3.3.1 Plan Recognition and Discourse Structure ................. 82
  3.3.2 Interpretation As Abduction .................................. 90
3.4 Other Theories that Use Rhetorical Relations ............ 102
3.5 Empirical Approaches to Discourse Interpretation .... 105
3.6 Some Concluding Remarks ...................................... 108

### 4 The Logical Form of Discourse

4.1 Introduction .......................................................... 111
4.2 Underspecification and Pragmatic Supplementation .......... 113
4.3 Underspecified Logical Forms for Clauses ................. 116
  4.3.1 Other Sources of Underspecification ......................... 123
  4.3.2 The Syntax of ULFs ........................................... 125
  4.3.3 The Interpretation of ULFs .................................. 129
4.4 The Syntax of the Discourse Language ..................... 135
  4.4.1 A General Approach to Syntax ................................ 137
4.5 A Language for Describing Logical Forms .................. 141
4.6 The Vocabulary of Discourse Relations ..................... 145
4.7 Hierarchical Structure And Availability .................. 146
4.8 The Logic of Information Content .............................. 155
  4.8.1 Elaboration and Explanation ................................ 159
  4.8.2 Narration: A Case for Scalar Coherence ................. 162
  4.8.3 Background .................................................. 165
  4.8.4 Parallel and Contrast ....................................... 168
  4.8.5 Macrostructure meets Microstructure ....................... 169
4.9 Unpacking the Truth Conditions: An Example ............. 171
4.10 Introducing Holes into Discourse Structures ............ 173
4.11 Conclusion .......................................................... 177

### 5 Building Logical Forms for Discourse

5.1 Introduction .......................................................... 179
5.2 Filling in Holes ..................................................... 180
  5.2.1 The Need for Nonmonotonic Inference ...................... 181
  5.2.2 The Logic: Some preliminary remarks ...................... 183
5.3 The Glue Language .................................................. 184
5.4 Some Formal Details ........................................... 186
  5.4.1 Syntax .................................................. 186
  5.4.2 Semantics .............................................. 188
  5.4.3 The Logic: Brief Overview ............................... 189
  5.4.4 The Logic: Some Formal Details ......................... 192
5.5 Transferring Information into the Glue Language ............. 194
5.6 Some Default Rules for Inferring Discourse Relations ......... 199
  5.6.1 Narration ............................................... 199
  5.6.2 Explanation, Elaboration and Result ..................... 204
  5.6.3 Background ........................................... 207
  5.6.4 Parallel and Contrast .................................. 208
5.7 Inferring Discourse Relations: Some Examples ................. 209
5.8 Putting the Pieces together: SDRS Update ..................... 212
5.9 Working Through a Bigger Example ............................ 223
5.10 Formulating Maximal Discourse Coherence .................... 230
  5.10.1 Some Applications of MDC ................................ 235
5.11 Interpreting Presuppositions ................................ 238
5.12 Conclusions ................................................ 246

6 The Lexicon and Discourse Structure .......................... 249
  6.1 Introduction ............................................... 249
  6.2 What is in the Lexicon? .................................... 250
  6.3 Lexical Semantics in Review ................................ 253
    6.3.1 Inheritance Structure ................................ 254
    6.3.2 Argument and Event Structure ........................ 264
  6.4 Lexical Information to Discourse Structure ................. 273
    6.4.1 Cases where Rhetorical Connections are Lexically Specified 273
    6.4.2 Defeasible Inferences from Lexical Information .......... 279
    6.4.3 Exploiting Information about Subtypes in the Lexicon .... 282
    6.4.4 Subcategorisation Frames and Discourse Structure ......... 283
  6.5 From Discourse Structure to Lexical Interpretation .......... 288
  6.6 Conclusion ................................................ 291

7 Discourse Relations for Dialogue ............................. 293
  7.1 Introduction ............................................... 293
  7.2 Why Dialogue and Monologue are Similar ....................... 293
    7.2.1 Availability in Dialogue ................................ 293
    7.2.2 Rhetorical Relations in Monologue and Dialogue .......... 296
  7.3 Some Differences Between Monologue and Dialogue ............ 298
    7.3.1 An SDRS for Each Agent? ............................... 298
    7.3.2 Cognitive Constraints on Anaphora ........................ 301
  7.4 SDRT and Speech Acts ...................................... 304
7.4.1 Indirect Speech Acts .......................... 307
7.5 Technical Details of SDRT for Dialogue ......................... 311
7.6 Simple Relations for Dialogue .......................... 313
  7.6.1 Indirect Question Answer Pairs ......................... 313
  7.6.2 Question Elaboration and Other Relations Involving Plans 320
  7.6.3 Question Coordination .......................... 329
  7.6.4 Other Relations Involving Questions ......................... 331
  7.6.5 Metatalk Relations .......................... 333
  7.6.6 Other Relations Involving Requests ......................... 336
7.7 Conclusions .................................. 341
7.4.1 Indirect Speech Acts .......................... 307
7.5 Technical Details of SDRT for Dialogue ......................... 311
7.6 Simple Relations for Dialogue .......................... 313
  7.6.1 Indirect Question Answer Pairs ......................... 313
  7.6.2 Question Elaboration and Other Relations Involving Plans 320
  7.6.3 Question Coordination .......................... 329
  7.6.4 Other Relations Involving Questions ......................... 331
  7.6.5 Metatalk Relations .......................... 333
  7.6.6 Other Relations Involving Requests ......................... 336
7.7 Conclusions .................................. 341
8 Disputes in Dialogue .................................. 343
  8.1 Introduction ................................ 343
  8.2 Some Motivating Examples .......................... 343
  8.3 Correction: The Analysis of one Divergent Relation ........ 345
      8.3.1 Some Formal Details ......................... 350
  8.4 Settledness ................................ 361
  8.5 An Analysis of an Extended Example ......................... 368
  8.6 Conclusion ................................ 373
9 Cognitive Modelling .................................. 375
  9.1 Introduction ................................ 375
  9.2 Cognitive Modelling for Discourse Interpretation .......... 376
      9.2.1 The Rich Logic of Attitudes ......................... 378
      9.2.2 The Shallow Language .......................... 379
      9.2.3 The Syntax and Semantics of the Language ........ 385
      9.2.4 Axioms of Rationality and Cooperativity ........ 390
      9.2.5 Deriving Cognitive Modelling Axioms ........ 401
  9.3 From Cognitive Models to Discourse Structure ........ 403
      9.3.1 Responses to Questions ......................... 403
      9.3.2 Some Examples .......................... 405
      9.3.3 The Rhetorical Role of Questions ......................... 406
      9.3.4 Some More Examples .......................... 409
      9.3.5 Indicatives that Elaborate Plans ........ 410
      9.3.6 Inferring the Unexpected ......................... 412
      9.3.7 Imperatives in Dialogue .......................... 413
  9.4 Axioms for Discourse Relations Based on Structure ........ 415
  9.5 Applications ................................ 416
      9.5.1 Cognitive Coordination ......................... 416
      9.5.2 Calculating Implicatures ......................... 418
  9.6 More Implicatures: Turn taking ......................... 427
  9.7 Conclusions ................................ 427
10 Some Concluding Remarks 429
  10.1 What We’ve Done 429
  10.2 The Dynamic Logic of Information Content 432
  10.3 Semantic Underspecification 435
  10.4 Discourse Update 436
  10.5 The Logic of the Lexicon 438
  10.6 The Logic of Cognitive Modelling 440
  10.7 Comparison with Other Theories 441
  10.8 Where We Go From Here 442

A Objections and Replies 445
  A.1 Introduction 445
  A.2 Questions of Detail 445
     A.2.1 Is the Glue Logic too Complex? 445
     A.2.2 Representationalism 446
     A.2.3 Empirical Difficulties: Generalisability and Falsifiability 447
  A.3 Questions of Principle 447
     A.3.1 Can Discourse Structure be Eliminated? 448
     A.3.2 Cognitive Foundations of Rhetorical relations 450

B Notation Index 453

C The Semantics of DRT 457

D Glossary of Discourse Relations 459
  D.1 Introduction 459
  D.2 Content-Level Relations 459
     D.2.1 Content-Level Relations for Indicatives 460
     D.2.2 Content-Level Relations Involving Interrogatives 463
     D.2.3 Content-Level Relations Involving Imperatives 464
  D.3 Text Structuring Relations 465
  D.4 Cognitive-Level Discourse Relations 466
  D.5 Divergent Relations 469
  D.6 Metatalk Relations 470

E Summary of Discourse Update 473
  E.1 Summary of the Glue logic Axioms 473
  E.2 Discourse Update Definitions 475

F Some Proofs in the Glue Logic 479
  F.1 The Specificity Principle 479
  F.2 An Example Involving Specificity 479